



**Citizens Committee to
Complete the Refuge
SAN FRANCISCO BAY**

January 29, 2024

Bay Conservation and Development Commission
R. Zachary Wasserman, Chair, Rebecca Eisen, Vice Chair, Members of the Commission
Email submittal to PublicComment@bcdc.ca.gov

RE: Comment on 2024-1-18 DRAFT One Bay Vision

Dear Chair Wasserman, Vice-Chair Eisen and Members of the Commission,

The [Sierra Club Bay Alive Campaign](#) works to protect and enhance shoreline ecosystems and build community resilience to sea level rise. The [Citizens Committee to Complete the Refuge](#) (CCCR) has spent decades protecting the Bay's tidal wetlands and listed and rare species, recognizing that the protection of the Bay's habitats is crucial in protecting the Bay and our communities as sea levels rise.

We are encouraged to note that BCDC is making progress on the Regional Shoreline Adaptation Plan (RSAP). We hope to see a final One Bay Vision that implements [Bay Adapt's six guiding principles](#), and makes clear to local governments and planners what it means to "Put Nature First Whenever Possible" and "Support Socially Vulnerable Communities" and explains clearly how they can do so.

With that in mind, we hope you will strengthen the draft One Bay Vision to:

1. Emphasize the importance of the shoreline ecosystems services that we all rely on for Bay resilience and the health and safety of our communities.
2. Embrace region-wide engagement to address past, current, and future inequities that lead to disproportionate sea level rise harms in communities with the least capacity to adapt.

Please consider the following suggested additions/modifications (in red):

**Regional Overarching
Vision**

In this future, communities are healthy, safe, and equitable and **the critical ecosystem services provided by the Bay's habitats are prioritized and protected. All Bay Area residents** have access to our shorelines where they can experience the beauty and wonder of **a thriving habitats along the Bay's edge. San Francisco Bay.** Our region remains connected so that networks of people and goods can move with ease and get to the places they need to go. The services we rely upon keep our communities and economies running and are designed for the long-term. Achieving this future will require governments, the private sector, and communities to collaboratively, thoughtfully, and efficiently take on complex, interrelated challenges, **including disproportionate impacts to vulnerable communities,** together. A resilient future for the San Francisco Bay Area starts now and continues for generations to come.

- | | |
|--|---|
| 1. Community Health and Wellbeing | <p>Communities are healthy and vibrant.</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> Address risks to essential community assets, services, including Bay ecosystem services, and cultural resources. |
| 2. Critical Infrastructure and Services | <p>Critical services are reliable.</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> Adapt existing local and regional critical infrastructure systems including natural infrastructure that provides ecosystem services, to maintain or improve service continuity for everyone, while minimizing vulnerabilities of new infrastructure networks to future flooding hazards. |
| 3. Ecosystem Health and Resilience | <p>Healthy Bay Ecosystems thrive</p> |
| 4. Governance, Collaboration, and Finance | <p>Regional Collaboration drives efficient and effective adaptation</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> Local and regional governments collaborate to address shared flooding risk, identify multi-benefit adaptation opportunities putting nature first whenever possible, and avoid adverse flooding impacts to other jurisdictions. Vulnerable communities with the least ability to adapt are supported through community empowerment and coordinated regional investment in planning, infrastructure and outcomes. |
| 5. Housing, Development and Land Use | <p>Places are designed for a changing shoreline</p> |
| 6. Public Access and Recreation | <p>The Bay Shoreline is accessible to all</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> Balance human enjoyment to be compatible with healthy ecosystems so that all have access to a thriving shoreline. |
| 7. Shoreline Contamination | <p>People and ecosystems are safe from contamination risks</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> Integrate emerging science on shallow groundwater rise and prioritize nature-based solutions, for that purpose, into planning and adaptation decisions. |
| 8. Transportation and Transit | <p>Safe and reliable transportation connects the region</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> Use redesign of transportation projects to also protect and improve Bay ecosystem services and address equity issues. |

Thank you for your consideration.

Sincerely,

Arthur Feinstein

Arthur Feinstein, Chair
Sierra Club, Bay Alive Campaign

Carin High

Carin High, Co-Chair
Citizens Committee to Complete the Refuge

CC Jacklyn Mandowski, BCDC
Dana Brechwald, BCDC

From: Sheila Brady

Date: Wednesday, January 31, 2024 at 6:09 PM

To: BCDC PublicComment <publiccomment@bcdc.ca.gov>

Subject: BCDC comment

Dear BCDC board members,

I read your draft version of the Regional Shoreline Adaptation Plan. Thanks very much for the work you have done so far.

I have to admit that I am hoping that you will strive to be even more directive and committed in your protections of the existing and operational green infrastructure (the SF Estuary) that

- cleans our water,
- protects the wildlife,
- buffers surf and tidal flows, flooding, and Sea Level Rise,
- secures our temperate climate,

for all our communities, especially those which are impoverished and truly at risk of displacement.

The cost to our future generations if this commitment on your part is half-hearted or weak will be billions of dollars spent by our children in

- * cleaning poisoned water to protect fisheries,
- * Rebuilding grey infrastructure to replace the walls that will be eroded since they are no longer protected by marshlands
- * Massive health costs from poisoned waters and poisoned air which cannot be cleaned as they now are by natural mechanisms

And obviously the aesthetic loss of miles of open space and recreational areas that keep 9 million people sane and willing to live cooperatively in relatively close quarters with each other.

I expect that you will affirm that your mission is to protect with full vigor any degradation of our wildlife's ecological niche and our people's quality of life, especially when that degradation exists solely for the benefit of individual and development companies who are simply trying to make a buck by selling the resources that should belong to all of us.

The entire SF Estuary was declared in 1971 by The United States representative authority to be A Wetland of International Importance according to the rules of the Convention on Wetlands' Contracting Parties or the Ramsar List. The detail of the SF Estuary's participation on the list is described here: <https://rsis.ramsar.org/RISapp/files/RISrep/US2097RIS.pdf>. Of course, part of that agreement is that the convention of all those participating countries will be notified should their wetlands be put in any way at risk.

During the COP 14 (Nov 2022) in Resolution XIV.17 "The protection, conservation, restoration, sustainable use and management of wetland ecosystems in addressing climate change" the conference of contracting parties:

9. STRONGLY ENCOURAGES Contracting Parties to urgently phase out or modify policies, to the extent possible, that contribute to wetlands loss and degradation, and pursue policies and projects to conserve and restore wetlands;

I strongly encourage you to review in detail the text of that resolution,

https://www.ramsar.org/sites/default/files/documents/library/xiv.17_climate_change_e.pdf

to which, the BCDC is morally bound as assigned by the representative of the United States as a participating member of the conference of contracting parties.

In whatever way you can phrase this moral commitment more strongly in your vision document would be greatly appreciated.

Thanks very much, and with great respect, for all the work that you do for all of us,

Sheila Brady

Secretary Skylonda Mutual Water Company.

(Since 1931 - volunteers providing clean healthy water to a small community of 155 houses)